

EXHIBIT 4

Hide

Re: From Ed Butowsky...please confirm you received.

January 26, 2017 at 6:38 AM

From ed butowsky >

To joel rich >

Thank you for acknowledgement.
As we discussed, let's not share this with anyone.
I believe I am going to get my hands on the FBI REPORT.
Be well.

On Jan 26, 2017, at 1:33 AM, joel rich <joelrich48@gmail.com> wrote:

Hi Ed,

I received file.

I'll be in touch after we have a chance to listen to it.

Thank you.

Joel

On Wed, Jan 25, 2017 at 4:23 PM, ed butowsky <edbutowsky@icloud.com> wrote:

Sent from my iPad

Hide

From ed butowsky

February 28, 2017 at 12:29 PM

From ed butowsky >

To joel rich >

Good afternoon. I believe I have a route to start getting you really good unfiltered proof. I know this is a very emotional subject but as you said if I have something credible show it to you.

Would you be interested in seeing the surveillance video ?

I am in Washington and a friend of mine has access to it. I can get a copy if you want it?

With your permission I have a private investigator that I will hire on your behalf (I will take care of all the money) to give me what she already has in his possession.

Hide

Re: From ed butowsky

February 28, 2017 at 12:32 PM

From ed butowsky >

To joel rich >

FYI... he is a former homicide investigator in DC.

On Feb 28, 2017, at 1:29 PM, ed butowsky <edbutowsky@icloud.com> wrote:

Good afternoon. I believe I have a route to start getting you really good unfiltered proof. I know this is a very emotional subject but as you said if I have something credible show it to you.

Would you be interested in seeing the surveillance video ?

I am in Washington and a friend of mine has access to it. I can get a copy if you want it?

With your permission I have a private investigator that I will hire on your behalf (I will take care of all the money) to give me what she already has in his possession.

Re: From ed butowsky

March 2, 2017 at 5:03 PM

From ed butowsky

To joelrich

Hide

Great. I just received a lot of new info that is interesting and troubling at the same time.

Rod Wheeler, the private investigator I want to hire, has already uncovered some info that he will share immediately with you. I will stand by to hear from you.

Please remember, this is all on me. No money from you ever.

On Mar 2, 2017, at 3:47 PM, joel rich <joelrich49@gmail.com> wrote:

Definitely interested.

Let me talk with Mary.

Sorry for delay responding.

Thank you,

Joel

On Tue, Feb 28, 2017 at 11:32 AM, ed butowsky <edbutowsky@icloud.com> wrote:

> FYI... he is a former homicide investigator in DC.

> On Feb 28, 2017, at 1:29 PM, ed butowsky <edbutowsky@icloud.com> wrote:

>

> Good afternoon. I believe I have a route to start getting you really good unfiltered proof. I know this is a very emotional subject but as you said if I have something credible show it to you.

>

> Would you be interested in seeing the surveillance video?

> I am in Washington and a friend of mine has access to it. I can get a copy if you want it?

> With your permission I have a private investigator that I will hire on your behalf (I will take care of all the money) to give me what she already has in his possession.

>

>

>

Re: From ed butowsky

March 3, 2017 at 7:39 AM

From ed butowsky >

To joelrich >

Hide

I am acknowledging and agreeing with your desire to have control over any and all comments.

Rod Wheeler has been officially hired and is diligently working on it. He can I will get the video and a lot more than that. Is it okay if he wanted to call you?

My cell is 972.897.0197

Rod's is 202.368.3007

Sent from my iPad

On Mar 2, 2017, at 5:47 PM, joel rich <joelrich48@gmail.com> wrote:

Ed

Any information that has validity is what will help find out what happened.

If the investigator can get the video or other information, we definitely want to go ahead. We do not want anything released that this is in our possession until, and if, we choose to make a comment.

Is he the investigator who was on Fox last September?

We are VERY appreciative of your help!

Thank you.

Joel and Mary

On Thu, Mar 2, 2017 at 4:03 PM, ed butowsky <edbutowsky@icloud.com> wrote:

Great. I just received a lot of new info that is interesting and troubling at the same time.

Rod Wheeler, the private investigator I want to hire, has already uncovered some info that he will share immediately with you.

I will stand by to hear from you.

Please remember, this is all on me. No money from you ever.

Hide

Re: From ed butowsky

March 3, 2017 at 9:52 AM

From ed butowsky >

To joel rich >

Yes. He is that same person.

I will call him right now to set that up.

On Mar 3, 2017, at 9:37 AM, joel rich <joelrich48@gmail.com> wrote:

Ed

Thanks for helping us work on resolving this.

Yes, it would be okay for Rob to contact me. If I do not have time for a longer call I will call him back. If he can let me know when he wants to visit, I will make sure I'm at an area to talk openly. If you want to setup a good time for me to call him, that will also work.

Is Rob the same person who is in this video from last August?

<http://video.foxnews.com/v/5079544790001/?#sp=show-clips>

Joel

Hide

Re: From ed butowsky

March 3, 2017 at 10:01 AM

From ed butowsky >

To joelrich >

I just spoke with Rod . Can you accept a call at 12:15 et/ 11:15 central?

Sent from my iPad

Hide

Re: From ed butowsky

March 3, 2017 at 10:42 AM

From ed butowsky >

To joelrich >

I will let him know and to look for a call from the 402 area code.

I am certain , you will get facts quickly.

Enjoy the rest of your day.

202.368.3007 is his number

Sent from my iPad

On Mar 3, 2017, at 10:35 AM, joel rich <joelrich48@gmail.com> wrote:

I should be free then. Why don't I call him when I get to quiet spot?

Joel

On Fri, Mar 3, 2017 at 9:01 AM, ed butowsky <edbutowsky@icloud.com> wrote:
I just spoke with Rod . Can you accept a call at 12:15 et/ 11:15 central?

Sent from my iPad

Hide

From ed butowsky

March 3, 2017 at 2:26 PM 

From ed butowsky :

To joelrich48@gmail.com

 Seth Rich ...s Retained.pdf 129.95 KB

I understand you had a nice and rather fruitful conversation with Rod Wheeler.

We are going to get to the bottom of this. Rod is simply the best .

Attached is the basic agreement for Rod. With this, he can and will aggressively get you a lot of pertinent information. I said from the beginning , I will do whatever I can to help get you and your family the knowledge of what happened.

After reading and " running it by " whomever you feel needs to see it , please sign and send back to me.

You can fax it 972.386.9285 or nowadays you can just take a picture of the document and text or email it back to me.

I am paying all bills.

Please let me know when you have sent the signed document. The moment it is received, Rod will immediately take it downtown and start his work.

You will be pleased .

Re: From ed butowsky

March 5, 2017 at 2:24 PM

From ed butowsky >

To joel rich >

Hide

Please let me know if you are ok with me hiring Rod on your behalf. You will have no obligations of any kind.

As I said previously, I am certain he will get you answers and I am footing the bill.

I know he already has info for you and I am sure he will share regardless if he is retained. But their will be a lot more info coming as he gets involved and we can finally , for your family, solve this.

On Mar 3, 2017, at 7:26 PM, joel rich <joelrich48@gmail.com> wrote:

Thanks for sending the form. I did feel the conversation was good. We'll look over the form and get it back to you.

Joel

On Fri, Mar 3, 2017 at 1:26 PM, ed butowsky <edbutowsky@icloud.com> wrote:

I understand you had a nice and rather fruitful conversation with Rod Wheeler.

We are going to get to the bottom of this. Rod is simply the best .

Attached is the basic agreement for Rod. With this, he can and will aggressively get you a lot of pertinent information. I said from the beginning , I will do whatever I can to help get you and your family the knowledge of what happened.

After reading and " running it by " whomever you feel needs to see it , please sign and send back to me.

You can fax it 972.386.9285 or nowadays you can just take a picture of the document and text or email it back to me.

I am paying all bills.

Please let me know when you have sent the signed document. The moment it is received, Rod will immediately take it downtown and start his work.

You will be pleased .

Re: Agreement

March 13, 2017 at 7:53 AM

From ed butowsky >

To joelrich >

Hide

Good morning. I have left him two messages with no response. However my messages were pretty detailed. I would feel a lot more comfortable if I knew he understood how important it was for him to go away and stop presenting a relationship with you .

Please confirm that you're OK with that.

I understand you getting the agreement back today, I'm very confident you will have answers very soon.

In fact I know you will!

On Mar 12, 2017, at 12:58 PM, joel rich <joelrich48@gmail.com> wrote:

Ed

We should have signed agreement back to you shortly. Just waiting on our son to sign.

Also, wanted to confirm again whether or no you had any conversations with Jack Burkman.

Thanks again for your help! We really appreciate your assisting us in this. Hopefully this will allow us to learn what happened.

Re: Agreement

March 13, 2017 at 10:33 AM

From ed butowsky :

To joel rich :

Hide

Can we do 8 pm central ?

On Mar 13, 2017, at 9:23 AM, joel rich <joelrich48@gmail.com> wrote:

Ed

When would be a good time for me to call you this afternoon or evening? I'd like to discuss this a little more and include my son in the conversation.

Thanks.

On Mon, Mar 13, 2017 at 7:53 AM, ed butowsky <edbutowsky@icloud.com> wrote:

Good morning. I have left him two messages with no response. However my messages were pretty detailed. I would feel a lot more comfortable if I knew he understood how important it was for him to go away and stop presenting a relationship with you .

Please confirm that you're OK with that.

I understand you getting the agreement back today, I'm very confident you will have answers very soon.

In fact I know you will!

On Mar 12, 2017, at 12:58 PM, joel rich <joelrich48@gmail.com> wrote:

Ed

We should have signed agreement back to you shortly. Just waiting on our son to sign.

Also, wanted to confirm again whether or no you had any conversations with Jack Burkman.

Thanks again for your help! We really appreciate your assisting us in this. Hopefully this will allow us to learn what happened.

Re: Address

April 7, 2017 at 5:41 AM

From ed butowsky >

To joelrich >

It'll be the greatest Passover dessert I ever I get.

Ed Butowsky
2200 Bradbury Ct Plano , tx 75093

thank you very much. Let's hope we start getting you some answers real soon.

On Apr 6, 2017, at 8:47 PM, joel rich <joelrich48@gmail.com> wrote:

Ed

We hope your recovery is preceding on schedule! Mary has found a marble cheesecake and now we need an address to ship it to.

We hope you have a pleasant Passover.

Mary and Joel

Hide

On Aug 18, 2017, at 5:08 PM, Joel <jrich12105@gmail.com> wrote:

Ed,

I'm not sure I even want to respond to you since you don't seem to have heard anything we have ever said to you! Since you have repeatedly accused me and my family, in both public and private venues, of having information related to Seth's murder that we're keeping secret, I feel compelled to try to respond.

Again your accusation is false and offensive! I am writing this to urge you to think carefully about how you would feel if someone did this to you, and to consider the harm you and your actions have and are causing my family, by pursuing this path that you seem to be hell bent on.

I know you are keen on wanting to prove Seth was a source of the emails to Wikileaks; and I believe, if you were an honest man, you would admit that you had that agenda when you first contacted us! You should be ashamed of your actions. To this date, despite your threatening texts and emails, no one, not even you, has presented us or the police with any evidence that supports your theory.

Instead all we get are threats from you (and others), conspiracy theories, and promises that someday soon, hidden evidence will be revealed.

As we've told you before, we will go where actual factual evidence takes us. If ever there is evidence regarding your conspiracy theory on our son Seth, we would accept it for what it is--but we're not going to accept lies.

Contrary to what you have been saying about our family, we want the truth and we will cherish our son and his memories for the wonderful young man he was.

You see Ed, that's the thing. We are interested in facts, not rumors or sensationalizing a story! Not rumors. Not third hand reports from anonymous sources within the FBI who are not revealed. Not promises of evidence soon to be revealed from cable hosts or Twitter want to be's. We want facts that are backed up by evidence.

That is what we wanted from the start, and we are tired of people trying to manipulate us to advance their own agendas. You should be ashamed to have come to us the way you did and claim to be an honest man!

A while back, you told me that your reporter friend at Fox had discovered evidence about the weapon and who had it. You said that it would disturb us, but that it was solid evidence, and you urged us to call her. So what did I do? I called her. And what was her disturbing evidence? She had none. She instead said that she had heard rumors that there was a break in to a car of an FBI agent in the vicinity of Seth's murder, and a gun that had gone missing could possibly have been related to the crime. But that break-in was previously reported and investigated. We never heard another word from you or anyone else about the gun that she said had gone missing. The truth is that every time you have claimed to have evidence, all we have gotten is rumors and theories. And when those theories do not pan out, you never admit you were wrong, or apologize for giving false hope. To date, you have failed to deliver anything but pain and heartbreak.

I understand that you are now spreading rumors that Aaron was involved in one way or another. That claim is false; ridiculous actually, and I am certain you have no real evidence that backs up your rumor. Every time you repeat these false rumors, you are harming Aaron's reputation, risking his job prospects, and upsetting Mary and I by hurting the only son we have left.

As for the threats you say your family has received: we have said and done nothing to encourage threats to you or your family. To the contrary, we find threats like those you have described to be disgusting, we condemn any person who would make them, and we hope that you have reported the threats to law enforcement so that they can find and punish whoever is involved.

As for us, Ed, enough is enough. I would ask you, out of respect for a family that has already lost a son and a brother, please leave us alone, stop saying false and hurtful things about us and Aaron, and stop trampling our memory of Seth.

Joel Rich

402-639-7768 Cell

From: ed butowsky

Hide

To: Brad - ed butowsky

I have been reaching out to you for months and now you respond.

Why did you move up lies about me?

Why did you stand by when lies were said about me and you know very very well they weren't true.

Everyone in the world, thanks to your desire not to speak out and tell the truth, thinks I originally reached out to you for nefarious purposes.

Never happened and you know that well.

I have never met the President nor was involved with any such plan to do something to you and your family.

Still don't have any idea what that would have been.

I was very genuine when I offered to pay the bill for a private investigator. I interviewed 7 prior to someone else recommending Rod Wheeler. You hired him.

Apparently, he did a good job and reported to you on his findings.

So I ask, why did you allow such horrendous lies about me go unchallenged. You can continue to make up stories about me having a path or a plan. I had none. I offered to help you find who murdered your son. That's all.

On the other hand, I was told by many, unsolicited (I never sought out), that you knew what your boys were involved with but kept it a secret. That's no secret since you and I had already discussed your knowledge of this.

That's your business. Apparently, you chose to keep that secret.

You once asked me why Brad Bauman was around you and how much you didn't like him. I told you I had no idea. You asked me to shoo away Jack Burkman.

Hard to keep up with who you liked and who you didn't like.

I am sure your friend Brad Bauman helped craft the letter you wrote to me.

The idea that I am creating a story is ridiculous. I offered to pay a bill to assist you in finding who murdered your child.

Not sure what your motivations are but I am sure what mine are.

I sleep well knowing that I thought I was helping a family to get answers by paying a bill for a private detective.

If you ever returned my calls we could have discussed everything.

I know no one who is my empathetic for you and Mary than I am for losing a child.

But when my kids are brutalized, their murders are called for, I had to put them in hiding with armed guards because you want to play some game, that is when I have zero tolerance.

I have been encouraging you for a few days to make a statement of what you have known for along time. Why? Because proof of somethings are about to be made public that is going to immediately change how people see things and I don't want you to be blind - sided and made to look awful.

You don't need that in your life.

I don't work for Fox and Malia Zimmerman is an open book and an excellent reporter. Call her. She will be more than happy to share everything and anything with you.

In Old Testament it says one lies through "omission". Have you been honest?

Wigdor and Wheeler are using your son's murder for financial gain. Not me. The made up story has zero truth to it and you know it.

So it begs the question, why are you silent?

I wrote this letter by myself and no one else helped me nor has any knowledge of it.

I suspect yours wasn't written only by you but I do not expect it to be used for any reason other than to communicate your view and feelings.

My letter will not be in social media but I suspect yours will. Especially since Brad Bauman is in your camp twisting things.

As I have offered to you many times and you have ignored, I am happy to have a very private sit down with you any time.

I suggest we do it prior to The congressperson sharing what he received from Julian Assange.

Saturday or Sunday works for me.

It will be private and no one will know it happened except you and I.

I am utterly disgusted by what has happened to my life and my family and my business due to all of this nonsense.

But I am willing to meet with you to clear things up. Have a nice Shabbat

Ed Butowsky

Hide

Re: Enough

August 13, 2017 at 6:13 PM

From: ed butowsky >

To: Joel >

I have no agenda never have .

I am not an investigator. I am not your investigator. That was Rod Wheeler. Take up conspiracies with him. I am not pursuing any theories. I am not pursuing anything.

Sir, do you remember when I first spoke with you I told you what I had heard and the first thing you and Mary said to me was that you had heard that months ago.

Stop with your nonsensical writing. I didn't even know who your son was nor did I really know anything about you or him. Didn't know you had another son. You are just making up stuff so it sounds good in a letter that you probably didn't write by yourself.

As I reread your letter it is obviously a marketing piece for someone but shouldn't be directed at me.

Please stop the nonsensical and completely void of facts attack on me.

If you want to meet as I said in the previous response, feel free to calm and I will fly up there and meet.

You can even being Aaron and Brad.Bauman if you wish.

I don't care.

Hide

Re: Enough

August 18, 2017 at 6:56 PM

From: ed butowsky >

To: Joel >

I cant stop re-reading your writing. Why would you suggest i wanted to prove where the emails came from when i truly had no interest at all. I reached out to share something with you , as you remember , we laughed about how I thought i had something to tell you that was important but you pointed out that the "rumor" had been out for 4 months. We discussed that being funny and showing that i knew so little about the situation. Mary and you were very nice and expressed interest in finding out who killed your son. You said the washington police wasn't answering your calls nor providing you any info.

This is why i find the writing sent to me so strange because it doesn't reflect at all our first conversation.

I had no agenda at all except being a nice person. What would my agenda be? I am a republican and a fiscal conservative. Since you have played a role in what has happened to me and my family, i now have an agenda but no one except my family and business partner know what it is. But i will share part of it with you . i want to be able to go back on Varney and company on Fox Business and discuss GDP numbers. Strange to some people but not to people who know me.

I could easily turn it around on you and your agenda but i wont. Many have wondered if you set me up but I don't think so. Just like I don't think you wrote this letter.

Please stop trying to turn me into a conspiracy person.

Rod Wheeler is a good investigator but screwed up and lied on tv. Then he was approached by a very bad attorney and offered a lot of money to go along with a made up story that to all sounds crazy. Within 2 days , on tv they admitted it was a lie.

Not sure why you wont call and visit. I have been reaching out to chat for 4 months.

Sent from my iPad

Re: Enough

August 18, 2017 at 7:49 PM

From edbutowsky >

To Joel >

Lastly, I haven't said a hurtful nor harmful thing about you. Please show me where I did. That statement is hogwash. Even during a terrible time that you aided in occurring I have. Even empathetic and respectful
You , on the other hand could care zero for my wife and children and what happened to a man who simply thought he was privately helping a man (you) and your family.

You can assign any agenda you want to me but I never had one. You are going to be very busy this high holiday.

Hide

Hide

Re: Enough

August 19, 2017 at 2:10 PM

From ed butowsky >

To Joel >

Joel/ Brad,

Since you are writing things for some public record (Brad Bauman, still waiting for you to respond to my direct messages from you) I will be precise. Good luck to all of you in doing whatever it is you are doing.

You make assertions that are false and deny saying things that you have said .

As I said from the outset, I offered to pay a bill and then you released my name for whatever reason you sought.

I dont know President , I am not a wealthy person and have and never really had any interest in any of this. I was just being a nice person.

It is obvious to most what is going on and soon the rest of the world will know. Not through me. I rarely ever discuss this subject.

Claim whatever you want to claim as the truth.

I really don't care.

I won't reach out again .

On Aug 19, 2017, at 1:42 PM, Joel <jrich12105@gmail.com> wrote:

Ed,

Are you going to really pretend like you haven't been trashing my family to anyone who will listen? Can you explain why are you saying in public that Aaron took money from Wikileaks and, in your own words, that Aaron "needs to come out and admit money is in his account." That's a lie, Ed, and you know it!

You keep referring to some secret Mary and I shared with you. I honestly have no idea what you are talking about. We didn't share any secret with you. We have no secrets about Seth. We've shared everything we know with the police, and we told you that. If you are going to accuse us otherwise, as you keep doing, then be a man and say what you have to say directly to us.

We have no interest in meeting with someone who continues to spread false hateful rumors about us and our son.

Joel Rich
402-639-7768 Cell
Sent from my iPad

Re: Enough

August 20, 2017 at 4:41 AM

From ed butowsky >

To Gmail >

Brad/ Joel,

You continue to write emails that make no sense. As I stated previously you can stick to any position you want. I will always tell the truth and I always have.

Brad, (all of this is directed at Brad not Joel since you are trying again to target me)

Perhaps you might be referring to your New York Times reporter friend who also is part of media matters, just like your personal friends at NPR. Or maybe your friend at washington post who I taped telling me that he needed to run something past you prior to reporting some facts (he never reported info due to you). Any reporter that calls me , as with anyone , gets the truth from me.

Joel , (this is for Joel only.)
you have my number. Call whenever to chat in person . Bring anyone you want. I never had any agenda. Just one man trying to help another. The total fictional story that has been wound together about me is so bizarre few believe it and I know you find it tough to stomach because you know it is all made up.

Joel,

Sent from my iPad

Hide

Re: Enough

August 20, 2017 at 11:02 AM

From: ed butowsky >

Hide

To: Joel >

Brad,

I have asked you very politely to leave me and my family alone. Harassing my children is something that is inexcusable. Your stories and lies are already legendary.

Go enjoy your Sunday.

Joel,

Happy to chat face to face anytime you want.

On Aug 20, 2017, at 11:55 AM, Joel <jrich12105@gmail.com> wrote:

Ed,

You are a liar. If you had any shred of decency, you would retract this lie and apologize. But we both know you won't.

<https://twitter.com/realmattcouch/status/899131911385358340>

<image1.PNG>

Joel Rich
402-639-7768 Cell
Sent from my iPad

On Aug 19, 2017, at 3:10 PM, ed butowsky <edbutowsky@icloud.com> wrote:

Joel/ Brad,

Since you are writing things for some public record (Brad Bauman, still waiting for you to respond to my direct messages from you) I will be precise.

Good luck to all of you in doing whatever it is you are doing.

You make assertions that are false and deny saying things that you have said .

As I said from the outset, I offered to pay a bill and then you released my name for whatever reason you sought.

I don't know President , I am not a wealthy person and have and never really had any interest in any of this. I was just being a nice person.

It is obvious to most what is going on and soon the rest of the world will know. Not through me. I rarely ever discuss this subject.

Claim whatever you want to claim as the truth.

I really don't care.

I won't reach out again .